



KING COTTON: AN ANALYSIS OF AN ALTERNATIVE HISTORY OF THE AMERICAN CIVIL WAR

Kai Santana Peterson

Department of Political Science

The American Civil war is remembered as a key domestic event in 19th century American History because of its transformational effects on the nation's culture, economy, self-image and sense of unity. The Civil War was the result of decades of tension between the industrialized north and the agricultural south. The systematic enslavement of black people used for plantation and household labor reached a contentious head when arguments about state's rights and economic differences locked arms with the abominable practice of slavery and its defense. This historic event had massive consequences on the future of the United States, which prompts the following question regarding the outcome of the war; How would the United States' foreign policy change if the United Kingdom assisted the confederacy to win the Civil War?

During the late 19th century, The United Kingdom was a large buyer of cotton, with France following close behind. The Confederate States of America (CSA) knew this, and the "King Cotton" actually involved the belief that The UK and France would aid the CSA in the civil war (Owsley, 1931). The Confederacy produced 75% of the world's cotton (Yafa, 2004). The production of cotton was seen as a great source of pride for the south, and was often romanticized in many ways including songs, festivals and decor. The exploitation of enslaved peoples was instrumental in the production of cotton at such a cheap price, and was the key reason that the South had so many buyers. In the cases of The UK and France, slavery had been abolished for decades, and these countries were not able to grow cotton at such a reduced price. These countries were, however, willing to purchase cotton from other nations that still had slave societies. This worked extremely well for the South, until the Civil War began in 1861. When war broke out, the Confederacy refused to send cotton to Europe in order to spur action based off of the subsequent rising prices of cotton (Anderson & Co., 1904). This was an effort that proved fruitless, as there was no aid supplied to the CSA. This action did cause a minor recession in the British economy, however, and cotton prices soared to levels that did impact the production of textiles in Europe as a whole. This reaction was not directly felt due to stockpiles of cotton, and the UK and France did nothing in retaliation (Ginzberg, 1936). It is also important to note that a war between the United Kingdom and the United States would not have been popular with the public of either country as it would have been extremely costly. Especially after the Emancipation Proclamation is given, which has been argued that the speech "reframed interventionist debates, thus (re)engendering the British anxiety over slavery and removing intervention as a viable policy." (Steele, 2005 pg. 519). In our hypothetical timeline, the Emancipation Proclamation is not given, because the Battle of Gettysburg was lost by the Union, and thus does not sway the British or reframe the purpose of the war.

A key piece of background revolves around the logistics of a southern victory. The Confederate States of America (CSA) was ultimately defeated due to a combination of military leadership, strategy and logistical operations which led the more industrialized north to a bloodied victory (Erath, 2015). The grueling, drawn out battles of the civil war led to an

estimated 620,000 dead (NPS.GOV, 2020). In the hypothetical counterfactual timeline, the Civil War is decided by a decisive battle in Philadelphia, which is aided by the United Kingdom and a small number of French forces who work to supply ground support to the Confederate forces at the Battle of Gettysburg. At this time in history, French forces were deployed in Mexico in the Second French Intervention from 1861 to 1867 for what was suggested by Napoleon III as economic reasons (Semple, 1864). In this counterfactual timeline, France understands that the potential economic benefit of a southern victory is also advantageous, and the French forces are reassigned to the American South, noting that they may be able to gain an ally for future use on the North American Continent. The confederate forces push the Union back in an astonishing show of force, while the European forces make landfall in Washington DC, causing the Union to fight a confused and bloodied battle of Hyattsville, but manages to maintain the nation's capital. Its forces are dispersed on multiple fronts, and Confederate troops advance.

One week after the factual conclusion of the Battle of Gettysburg on July 3rd, the Confederate and British forces launched a multi-legged campaign to take Philadelphia. Meanwhile, Abraham Lincoln of the United States waited with bated breath on details to be delivered via telegraph. On July 10th 1863, the confederacy attempted to discuss peace with the Union, and Lincoln, fearing that DC or Baltimore could be lost with another month of fighting, and The Treaty of Washington was signed the next day. The terms of the treaty would be that the South was to legally succeed from the Union, including the states of Texas, Arkansas, Louisiana, Mississippi, Alabama, Florida, South Carolina, North Carolina and Virginia. The Union was to recognize the CSA as a sovereign nation, with all business and entities existing in the Confederacy to be maintained as legalized under confederate war.

In the immediate aftermath of the Civil War, (Now referred to as the second revolutionary war by the CSA), the United States attempted to pick up the pieces of what turned out to be an extremely bloody war that ended quickly and unexpectedly. Memorials were constructed in DC to commemorate those who fought for the Union, and an increased sense of unity is abound with the states that remained. The Constitution of the Confederate States is adopted, constitutionalizing the practice of slavery. As stated in the Confederate Constitution in the historical timeline in Amended Article I Section 2(1), a prohibition on persons "of foreign birth" is established, those who were "not a citizen of the Confederate States" were prevented from voting "for any officer, civil or political, State or Federal" (Confederate States Constitution, Article 1 Section 2[1], 1861). Because of this, a migration of northern-born citizens left the confederacy and moved north, primarily moving to their hometowns, or moving to nearby Maryland. Borders were cleaned up, and the Union took on an animosity towards the South, as well as an increased interest towards the European countries that did not assist the CSA in the war. America develops a relationship with the quickly industrializing country of Prussia prior to the German Wars of Unification. Because the North does not have access to internally produced cotton for textiles, the industrialized United States is forced to purchase the raw materials for an increased price, those funds are used to industrialize The CSA around cities like Atlanta, Raleigh, Carollette, and especially in New Orleans. This occurs in our factual timeline to some extent as well, but the Confederacy is able to harness its "King Cotton" strategy to supply the economic changes that needed to occur in the country so that they could compete on a global scale.

The CSA attempts to annex Cuba in order to hypothetically use Cuban labor to expand its agriculturally viable land to include that of Cuba. This is a widely discussed counter-factual occurrence that would fail miserably, but may be attempted by the CSA, as it was discussed in the Confederate congress during its inaugural session. In a quote by Robert Rhett, CSA congressional representative from South Carolina "We will expand, as our growth and

civilization shall demand – over Mexico – over the isles of the sea – over the far-off Southern tropics – until we shall establish a great Confederation of Republics – the greatest, freest and most useful the world has ever seen." (Goodheart, 2010). This was a potential tactic that was debated in the confederate legislature, but it would not succeed in the hypothetical timeline.

This mission fails for multiple reasons, but primarily because the upper-class slave owning populous of the confederacy would be met with intense force after they attempt to gain influence over Cuba, as it was experiencing a large abolitionist movement at the time in the historical timeline (Corwin, 1967). In fact, part of the reason that the 10 Years War ignited in Cuba was due to the lax monitoring of the slavery ban, which saw an import of over 90,000 Africans from 1856-1860. This caused an economic recession that saw the collapse of dozens of sugar plantation businesses, with thousands of Cubans out of work during the period (Corwin, 1967). Needless to say, the Cuban people would be deeply angered by a proposed invasion by the Confederacy, causing massive mobilization against the force. The Cuban people would also turn down potential aid from the CSA as to not be obligated or indebted to the slavers.

In the altered timeline version of 1864, the Confederacy would develop an appetite to expand, as it discovers that a growing country would prove to be economically valuable, especially in regards to the land west of Texas, then owned by Mexico. During this time period, Mexico was under control by the French, who is an ally to the CSA in our hypothetical timeline. One piece of policy that was being pushed by France was the installation of Maximilian, Archduke of Austria as emperor of Mexico (McAllen, 2015). Seeing this opportunity to expand westward amongst the conflict and confusion of the area, the Confederacy would mobilize their army and navy to aid the installation of Maximilian, and maintain the popularity of him by threat of force. This would gain additional favor by France, who would intern allow Mexico to sell less populated northern states of Sonora and Chihuahua. These states would be key in opening up the CSA to the Pacific Ocean, allowing for the planned building of a Confederate transcontinental railroad that would allow for international shipping of Cotton and textiles to Asia. The United States' official position was to continue to recognize Benito Juárez as the legal president of Mexico, as was true in the historical timeline. They believed French invasion as a violation of the Monroe Doctrine, but was unable to intervene due to the presence of Confederate soldiers in the conflict, and this would be a refutation of the treaty signed after the Civil War (McAllen, 2015). This installation would still fail, ultimately, as what remained of the confederacy presence in the area would be defeated by Mexican Republican forces as the French pulled out of the area in 1866 to deal with the Franco-Prussian war (Harding, 1934). Mexico maintains roughly the same, but Baja California is later purchased by the Confederacy, as it is now completely separated from the rest of Mexico.

The economic system of the south is maintained, as the 3,521,110 slaves (US Census, 1860) would continue to be economically and politically marginalized. The additional 132,760 free people of color would decrease to around 30,000 as slavery gained traction during the complete mechanization of the plantation system used to fund industry in the CSA. The Confederacy would maintain the practice of slavery until the early 1900's, when in 1902, the distaste of European citizens turned to outrage, and the governments of the UK and France refused to purchase cotton from the CSA if it continued to support slavery. Begrudgingly, the CSA would stop supporting the practice, and the black population of the south became free. However, the economic exploitation was still needed to support the growing factories of Atlanta New Orleans and the capital city of Montgomery. The "Black Codes" were introduced in the CSA, which dictate that black people were explicitly not allowed to vote, were unable to hold public office, and were not subject to the newly instituted labor laws that were being implemented in cities. Agricultural work done by former slaves is different only in name, as

inhumane working conditions are commonplace, with limited economic mobility for members of the black community. A distinct black culture develops in the South around Atlanta and southern South Carolina, and an increased pride in African heritage is used to maintain normalcy in the violent and exploitative Confederacy. Lynchings of both African Americans and Native Americans is commonplace, and violence is present in all aspects of life. In the historical timeline, 3,959 black men, women, and children were lynched in the twelve Southern states between 1877 and 1950 (Equal Justice Initiative, 2015). These numbers were actually increased in the hypothetical timeline due to the economic disparity and de jure segregation and labor related Black Codes. All native Americans are forced onto a reservation north of Texas in the unorganized Indian territory.

While reeling from the impact of the Civil war, the United States begins to feel the impact of not only being unable to receive cheap cotton, but being unable to see the return on any cotton that was exported to the UK and France. Because of this, the United States' westward expansion is thwarted in some ways, mainly in that the country is unable to purchase Alaska from Russia or annex Hawaii. The 1893 coup of Queen Lili'uokalani on the island of Oahu never occurs, and the Republic of Hawaii is never founded. In the historical timeline, the revolution's final goal was to allow the United States to annex the territory, but this idea is not mounted, as the United States is seen as too militarily and economically weak to support such a transition in the later years of the decade (Lucien, 1899).

Utah also sees multiple rebellions during this period, and the nation of Deseret is briefly established for four years before being put down by the United States. In this hypothetical timeline, the Mountain Meadows Massacre still occurs as California-Bound settlers make way from Arkansas, and are still murdered by the Nauvoo Militia in the Utah Territory (King, 2012). However, because the United States does not have the resources or inclination to support a conflict with the Mormons of Utah, President Buchanan is still urged by Congress to make peace with the fledgling territory. Then, because the people of Utah do not believe that the United States is inclined to move towards occupation of the territory if the situation escalated, they reject the offered pardon of the settlers and carry out their planned defense of the territory in the Weber and Echo Canyons (Littleford, 2001). The citizens of Utah rally around Brigham Young, and continue to retaliate in small scale skirmishes in northern Utah and southern Idaho as they reject the planned U.S. installment of Alfred Cumming (Littleford, 2001). Deseret is established as an independent country, maintaining the name of the unrecognized state in our timeline (Trinklein, 2010). The country operates as an independent country until 1868, when the planning of the transcontinental railroad leads to discussion by Brigham Young and his advisors to reconsider being adopted as a state, citing the economic benefit that the railroad would have one the state, they ultimately decide to close join the union, and the transcontinental railroad is completed as planned

The United States begins to receive massive amounts of Irish immigrants, while also seeing a sizable amount of German and Austria-Hungarian immigrants to fill the increased need for factory workers. German and Irish ghettos are commonplace in all major American cities, and relationship with Germany involves a formal alliance that was formed in the early 1910's. Because of the massive support that was provided for the Confederacy by The UK, America becomes a forgotten child of the Anglo-sphere. The UK essentially chose favorites with its support of the South, and the United States further distances itself in regards to military alliances with European powers. The United States is sandwiched between two countries that are deeply supported by the United Kingdom, and anti-British sentiment arises in northern American cities like Buffalo and others in New England. The U.S. distances itself from British identities, and

education in the states maintains that America is a melting pot, rather than an extension of the UK.

This close German relationship leads the United States to join sides with the Central Powers, while the confederacy joins the Allies during WWI. The CSA's relationship with The United Kingdom and France is still strong, and they happily support their efforts in the war. A large piece of their responsibility as an ally is to hold territory on the American continent. A second civil war is at hand, and the technological advancements since the last conflict between the CSA and USA is a bloody one. Trench warfare is adopted along the Mason-Dixon line, where territory advancements are scarce and not held for very long. Disease runs rampant at the end of WWI, and because of the trench warfare and home front war, the Spanish Flu caused an additional 50,000 deaths, on top of the estimated 675,000 that died in the United States in the historical timeline (CDC, 2019).

As WW1 enters its final year, the Confederacy is reeling from dealing with the Spanish Flu and fighting a war of attrition at its northern border. Meanwhile, a young W.E.B. Du Bois, self-identified socialist, led a Marxism inspired revolution to emancipate the black people of the CSA. In our timeline, Du Bois is deeply involved with Socialism in the 1920s, and supports the Soviet communism in the late 1920s and early 30s. Du Bois' later works incorporated a Marxist view of economics, specifically in his 1935 work *Black Reconstruction* (Saman, 2020). In this counterfactual timeline, Du Bois is more deeply impacted by the racist and systematic domination experienced by African-Americans on behalf of the CSA, and his transition towards Marxism is accelerated. His more radicalized views are spread through his writings right as a massive literacy movement is sparked by Robert Abbot, a contemporary of Du Bois, who used his fortune as the founder of the Chicago Defender to educate the black community in the south. The Chicago defender, now titled the Atlanta Defender (due to the absence of the great migration) was widely circulated. Du Bois' work and ideology spreads wildly, and he begins to hold lectures at Atlanta University, where he studied and taught a class on Marxism in the real timeline (Saman, 2020).

The industrialized Confederate cities saw massive labor movements, as were also seen in the United States in our real timeline. Du Bois acted as an organizer and was a deeply important revolutionary figure for the large black population in the South, molding the workers unionist movement to align with the principles of the Soviet Union and the Russian Revolution. A full-blown revolution was formed during the first World War in many major cities across the Confederacy. Decentralized, anarchical organization was adopted, and armed militias were founded in all urban Confederate cities. Electrical grids were ceased, and urban skirmishes overwhelmed Atlanta, Charleston and Savannah forming an area that was later expanded to cover the entirety of the state of Georgia. With the help of disgruntled Unionist people living in Northern Georgia in our timeline, the hypothetical revolution advanced north (Howard, 2015). A free-black state was established in Georgia, now called New Afrika. Atlanta is its capital city, and black people from across the South flock to the newly established state. A workers' communist democracy is formed out of the borders of Georgia and South Carolina. The black revolution was aided by the United States because they knew that it would take precious resources away from the trench war occurring along the border of the CSA and the USA.

The United States is forced to fight a two-front war during WWI, against British Canada in the North as well as against the Confederacy. Ultimately, the Mason-Dixon line is held and no territory is gained by either side. British Canada surrenders after the UK decides that resources are better spent attempting to hold European points than those across the Atlantic, and the United States gains control of the entire Canadian territory. A decisive battle is fought on the Detroit river, in an assault by British forces, similar to the half-hearted attempts to do so during The War

of 1812 (Hannings, 2012). American military personnel took the opportunity to advance across the border, and Toronto was captured by the Americans. The public of Canada is receptive to the annexation, and after the war, the South begins to expand its territory, as it views the North's expansion as a threat. WWI is seen as the United States' "Comeback moment", where a deep sense of pride and national honor is restored to the country.

The first world war resulted in similar outcomes in Europe, but post WWI involves a depleted south, stripped of many of its workers and desperately looking for a solution to their problems. The country enters a deep recession which allows the United States to flourish by comparison and the US experiences an economic boom with the flourishing of Toronto, California and the heartlands. Oil in Texas allows for the Confederacy to maintain economic stability and provides the country with wealth that it has not experienced up to this point. The timing is perfect, as at this point, cotton was not as valuable of a material and the south was forced to rely on its shaky manufacturing industry in order to sustain itself (Trading Economics, 2020).

The United States originally planned to stay neutral during WWII, as in the real timeline, but this time the reason was due to the relationship that had developed with Prussia continued in the region, due to the German diaspora in the states. Hawaii is not a state, nor is it owned by the US, the United Kingdom operates the islands (Called the Cook Islands) on December 7th 1941, meaning that the United States is not brought into WW2. That is, until Japan launched an attack on Santa Barbara, as they did in the historical timeline in the event known as the Bombardment of Ellwood (Hamilton, 2015). This time, however, the attack is much larger and causes casualties in high triple digits, prompting the United States to have no choice but to declare war on Japan, without officially declaring war on Germany. Nazi Germany is still defeated by British and Russian forces, but Japan is able to expand its empire throughout the Pacific until these territories are taken by the United States, and is not defeated in mainland Asia until they attempt to take territory in Manchuria and into the USSR. They would be defeated as they attempted to advance into this area known as Manchukuo, and their empire would begin to deteriorate with the help of the United States (Encyclopedia Britannica, 2007).

The Confederacy maintains its relationship with France and The United Kingdom, fielding troops, funds and supplies to aid the war effort in Europe. Because of this relationship, the CSA and the USA end up on the same side of a conflict for the first time since before the Civil War, and the sides coordinate distribution efforts in order to support one another after Japan attacks the coast of California. The CSA was never fully attacked during the war, but declared war on Germany because of its alliances with other European powers. CSA participates in D-Day, although the United States does not. Germany is still defeated due to how spread thin the Nazi battle strategy was during the time period.

Post WWII sees the CSA and USA develop a positive working relationship surrounding a free trade agreement that allows the countries to develop a symbiotic relationship that primarily benefits the dilapidated south. An influx of capital is invested in businesses there, spurring growth for both countries. Ultimately, a North American Union is established, that allows for the free movement of persons, labor and capital amongst the CSA and the USA. This decision allows for the two countries to share in the post war economic boom that was experienced in our timeline. The two countries essentially mirror each other in foreign policy, with both countries becoming members of NATO, and developing positive relationships with Europe as a whole.

Neither country is particularly supportive of reunification, as the two wars have left a cultural rift between the two nations. Education on the wars is different, depending on which side of the Mason-Dixon line that you live, but neither side represents the other favorably. The Confederacy develops a slightly different cultural identity from the USA, with distinct southern cuisine, music and agricultural lifestyle being a point of pride. The South is a popular vacation

destination for people in the USA, with Florida and Baja California being specifically popular as a nearby getaway. Some southerners visit the north for their liberal same-sex marriage laws and legalized marijuana, as the political climate of the South is very socially conservative, with religious undertones of government being outright requirements to be involved in government.

Bibliography

Erath, John. "Union Success in the Civil War and Lessons for Strategic Leaders." *National Defense University Press*, 1 Apr. 2015,

Eli Ginzberg. "The Economics of British Neutrality during the American Civil War". *Agricultural History*. Vol. 10, No. 4 (Oct. 1936), pp. 147–156 [in JSTOR](#)

Faust, Drew Gilpin. "Death and Dying--Civil War Era National Cemeteries: Discover Our Shared Heritage Travel Itinerary." *National Parks Service*, U.S. Department of the Interior,

Lebergott, Stanley. "Why the South Lost: Commercial Purpose in the Confederacy, 1861-1865." *Journal of American History* 1983

Jones, Howard, *Union in Peril: The Crisis over British Intervention in the Civil War* (1992)

Hubbard, Charles M. *The Burden of Confederate Diplomacy* (1998)

"Mexico and the West Indies" (pdf). *Daily Alta California*. San Francisco, United States: Robert B. Semple. XVI. (5310): 1. 16 September 1864. Retrieved 27 June 2012.

D.G. Littleford, *Utah War: U.S. Government Versus Mormons Settlers*, 8.

Michael J. Trinklein (2010). *Lost States: True Stories of Texlahoma, Transylvania, and Other States That Never Made It*. Quirk Books.

Saman, M. (2020). DU BOIS AND MARX, DU BOIS AND MARXISM. *Du Bois Review: Social Science Research on Race*, 1-22.

Howard, Rebecca Ann; 'Civil War Unionists and Their Legacy in the Arkansas Ozarks (Ph.D. thesis) (2015).

<https://tradingeconomics.com/commodity/cotton>

Hamilton, Nigel (2015). *The Mantle of Command: FDR at War, 1941–1942*. New York: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt. p. 216

CDC. "1918 Pandemic (H1N1 Virus)." *Centers for Disease Control and Prevention*, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 20 Mar. 2019,

Hannings, Bud (30 September 2012). The War of 1812: A Complete Chronology with Biographies of 63 General Officers

King, Gilbert (February 29, 2012). "The Aftermath of Mountain Meadows".
Smithsonian.com. US Government. Retrieved February 3, 2019.

As Study Finds 4,000 Lynchings in Jim Crow South, Will U.S. Address Legacy of Racial
Terrorism?". Democracy Now!. February 11, 2015. Retrieved June 20, 2020.

Encyclopædia Britannica, Article on Manchukuo Archived 21 December 2007

McAllen, M.M. (April 2015). A Lurid Grandeur. Maximilian & Carlota of Mexico. p.
123.

Harding, Bertita (1934). Phantom Crown: The story of Maximilian & Carlota of Mexico.
New York: Blue Ribbon Books.

Adam Goodheart (2010-12-16). "The Happiest Man in the South".

Frank Lawrence Owsley. King Cotton Diplomacy: Foreign relations of the Confederate
States of America (1931).

Bisson, Terry. *Fire on the Mountain*. Gazelle, 2009.

STEELE, B. (2005). Ontological security and the power of self-identity: British neutrality
and the American Civil War. *Review of International Studies*, 31(3), 519-540

Young, Lucien (1899). *The Real Hawaii*. Doubleday & McClure company. p. 252.

Turtledove, Harry. *The Guns of the South: a Novel of the Civil War*. Ballantine Books,
1997.